MARINA COAST WATER DISTRICT

Classification & Compensation Study Evaluation Matrix

18-Apr-12

- Did not meet satisfaction

- ✓ Satisfactory
- + Excellent

Provider	Rank	Methodologies	Timeline	Cost	Value	Governmental References	Quality of Proposal Includes Completion of Work in Phases	Comments
Public Sector Personnel Consultants	3	EZ COMP, SNAP staffing analysis, FES point-factor job evaluation	11 Weeks	\$16,500	√	+	√	Firm uses a proprietary program developed internally and scope of work includes upload of the program to HR. Broad use of methodologies for project completion. One year plan maintenance assistance at no cost. Proposal contains scope of work for MPWMD instead of MCWD. Recently retained by City of PG for comp study. Good references.
Koff and Associates	1	Use of similar type agency, structure, scope of services provided, labor market, demographics, and cost of living	8 Weeks Concurrent with classification study	\$18,595-\$23,670 (\$105/hour)	+	V	+	Firm conducted class and comp study for MCWD in 2003. Provided 2 Options - #1 = modified classification study w/ telephone vs. in-person interviews and 16 benchmark classes instead of 22. Option #1 will be charged at the lower end of the range with a not to exceed price. Includes post- implementation follow-up. Client list includes many recent cities and special districts. All references favorable.
Bryce Consulting	2	Decision making, scope and complexity, contacts, supervision, KSA's	15-16 Weeks	\$21,600-\$23,700 (\$150/hour)	+	+	N	Firm conducted the salary survey for FORA. Most of FORA's work was completed by in-house staff and consultant was flexible in pricing. Cost estimate for additional expenses higher than other proposals. Position Description Questionnaires may be labor intensive. Very good references.
CSI Human Resources Group, LLC		Not defined in proposal	12 Weeks	\$31,350 (\$150/hour)	-	V	N	Company is local. References good, but minimal public sector.
Ralph Anderson & Associates	4	Background analysis, JAQ's, briefing sessions, job analysis interviews, policy development, plan design	16 Weeks	\$29,900 (does not offer hourly rate)	√	√	+	Extensive client list of special districts, cities, counties. Total cost is a "fixed" price regardless of the number of hours required though a discounted hourly rate is offered should additional onsite meetings be required. Free follow-up for 6 months. Comprehensive Job Analysis Questionnaires. Most references were positive.
Hay Group	5	Hay Group Guide Chart-Profile (Know- How, Problem Solving, Accountability)	16 Weeks	\$49,200 (did not provide hourly rate)	-	+	+	Worldwide firm and industry leader in class and comp programs. Uses proprietary method of job evaluation. Do not require employees to complete a position anslysis if current one is acceptable. No mention of cost for follow up if necessary. Good references.